## 360 LRMoo

### R56 is related to (is related to)

**Vote** to update as suggested below, namely:

* to rename to R56 has related form (is related form of): on the grounds that this way it follows the pattern used for P130 shows features of (features are also found on).
* to change the full path back to: E89 Propositional Object. P67 refers to: E1 CRM Entity. P67 refers to: E89 Propositional Object
* to change the examples to fit the new label (follow the first one as a prototype)

In favor: 9
Against: none
**Outcome**: Accepted

**Decision**: according to the proposal, for details, see [below](#_R56_is_related)

#### R56 is related to (is related to)

The definition changed

##### FROM (old)

**R56 is related to (is related to)**

Domain:  [F12](#_2et92p0) Nomen

Range [F12](#_2et92p0) Nomen

Subproperty of: (none)

Shortcut of: E89 Propositional Object (1) *P1i identifies*: E1 CRM Entity *P1 is identified by:* E89 Propositional Object (2)

Quantification:  (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with another instance of F12 Nomen which co-refers to the same instance of E1 CRM Entity. In addition, the nomens may be related in some context, such as replacing former use, etc.. This property is transitive.

 The property R56.1 allows for specifying the particular kind of relationship that holds between the content (the associated instances of E62 String) of the domain nomen and the range nomen, such as by being a derivation, an alternative, a lexical variant, etc. Typing the association may introduce a meaning of the inverse direction which may cause loss of transitivity.

Examples: ‘Čajkovskij, Petr Ilʹič’ (F12) *is related to* ‘Пётр Ильич Чайковский’ (F12), with *has type* transliteration (E55).

 ‘The Lord of the Rings’ (F12) *is related to* ‘Le Seigneur des anneaux’ (F12), with *has type* original language (E55).

 ‘IFLA’ (F12) *is related to* ‘International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions’' (F12), with *has type* acronym.

 ‘Siam’ (F12) *is related to* ‘Thailand’ (F12).

 ‘595.7’ (F12) *is related to* ‘Insecta’ (F12). [The latter being the caption for the Dewey Decimal Classification number in the English language 23rd edition.]

Properties:  R56.1 has type: [E55](#_3znysh7) Type

##### TO (new)

**R56 has related form (is related form of)**

Domain: [F12](#_2et92p0) Nomen

Range:                 [F12](#_2et92p0) Nomen

Subproperty of:  (none)

Shortcut of: E89 Propositional Object (1). P67 refers to: E1 CRM Entity. P67 refers*:* E89 Propositional Object (2)

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note:  This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with another instance of F12 Nomen which co-refers to the same instance of E1 CRM Entity. This property is transitive.

The property R56.1 allows for specifying the particular kind of relationship that holds between the domain nomen and the range nomen, such as by being a derivation, an alternative, a lexical variant, etc. Typing the association may cause loss of transitivity.

Examples:

‘Čajkovskij, Petr Ilʹič’ as the name of the Russian composer (F12) has related form ‘Пётр Ильич Чайковский’ as the name of the Russian composer (F12), with *has type* transliteration (E55).

[the rest of the examples are to be updated accordingly]

Properties: R56.1 has type: [E55](#_3znysh7) Type

### R36 uses script conversion (is script conversion used in)

**Vote** to update as suggested below, namely:

* to modify the scope note, in order to clarify the script gets converted between scripts, not the nomen itself.
* to add an FOL constraint, indicating that the string of one instance of F12 Nomen is modified to create the string of the other instance of F12 Nomen.

In favor: 8
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R36_uses_script_1)
**HW**: MD to provide the FOL constraint

#### R36 uses script conversion (is script conversion used in)

The definition changed

##### FROM (old)

**R36 uses script conversion (is script conversion used in)**

Domain: F12 Nomen

Range: F36 Script Conversion

Is shortcut of: F12 Nomen. *R17i was created by (created):* E65 Creation. *P33 used specific technique (was used by)*: E29 Design or Procedure

Quantification: (0,1:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with the instance of F36 Script Conversion that was used to create the instance of F12 Nomen. The source of this conversion may or may not be explicitly mentioned.

Examples: ‘Du Fu’ as the name for a Chinese poet of the 8th century (F12) *uses script conversion* Pinyin (F36).

‘Čajkovskij, Petr Ilʹič’ as the name of the Russian composer (F12) *uses script conversion* ‘ISO 9 Information and documentation — Transliteration of Cyrillic characters into Latin characters — Slavic and non-Slavic languages’ (F36).

##### TO (new)

**R36 uses script conversion (is script conversion used in)**

Domain: F12 Nomen

Range: F36 Script Conversion

Is shortcut of: F12 Nomen. *R17i was created by (created):* E65 Creation. *P33 used specific technique (was used by)*: E29 Design or Procedure

Quantification: (0,1:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with the instance of F36 Script Conversion that was used to create the E62 String used in that instance of F12 Nomen from the string used in another instance of F12 Nomen that co-refers with the first nomen (the instances of F12 Nomen are related via the R56 has related form property). The source of this conversion may or may not be explicitly mentioned.

Examples: ‘Du Fu’ as the name for a Chinese poet of the 8th century (F12) *uses script conversion* Pinyin (F36).

‘Čajkovskij, Petr Ilʹič’ as the name of the Russian composer (F12) *uses script conversion* ‘ISO 9 Information and documentation — Transliteration of Cyrillic characters into Latin characters — Slavic and non-Slavic languages’ (F36).

### R35 is specified by (specifies)

Vote to update as suggested below, namely:

* change domain to F12 Nomen (F35 Nomen Use Statement having been deprecated)
* change range to F2 Expression (F34 Controlled Vocabulary intended to be deprecated in the near future)
* change superproperty to: P67i is referred to by
* edit the scope note to avoid mention to F35 and F34
* remove the .1 property
* addition of the “Insecta” example

In favor: 8
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R35_is_specified_1)

**HW**: PR to provide an example (name of an author not from a controlled vocabulary)

#### R35 is specified by (specifies)

The definition of the property changed

##### FROM (old)

**R35 is specified by (specifies)**

Domain: F35 Nomen Use Statement

Range: F34 Controlled Vocabulary

Subproperty of: E89 Propositional Object. P148 has component (is component of): E89 Propositional Object

Quantification: (1,1:1,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F35 Nomen Use Statement with an instance of F34 Controlled Vocabulary in which the Nomen Use Statement has a given status. The property R35.1 allows for specifying the particular status of the nomen use statement within the controlled vocabulary. An instance of *R35 is specified by* should have only one status.

Examples: ‘acoustic surface wave device’ (F35) *R35 is specified by* INSPEC Thesaurus version January 1973 (F34) *R35.1 has status* valid (E55)

‘acoustic surface wave device’ (F35) *R35 is specified by* INSPEC Thesaurus version June 1978 (F34) *R35.1 has status* obsolete (E55)

Properties: R35.1 has status: E55 Type

##### TO (new)

**R35 is specified by (specifies)**

Domain: F12 Nomen

Range: F2Expression

Subproperty of: E1 CRM Entity. P67i is referred to by: E89 Propositional Object.

Quantification: (1,1:1,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with an instance of F2 Expression which documents, defines or provides evidence for the particular nomen in the stated sense.

Examples: ‘acoustic surface wave device’ (F35) *R35 is specified by* INSPEC Thesaurus version January 1973 (F34) *R35.1 has status* valid (E55)

‘595.7’ as a classification number for the taxonomic class Insecta (insects) (F12) *is specified by* the 23rd edition of the Dewey Decimal Classification (DDC) (F2).

### R74 uses expression of (has expression used in)

**Vote** to update the property linking distinct works, one of which includes some expression of the other suggested below, namely:

* to accept scope note & examples,
* to assign IDNo
* to introduce FOL statement to express the constraint between the two instances of F1 Work

In favor: 8
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R74_uses_expression_1)

**HW**: MD to provide the FOL constraint btw the instances of F1 Work

#### R74 uses expression of (has expression used in)

**R74 uses expression of (has expression used in)**

Domain: F1 Work

Range: F1 Work

Subproperty of: E70 Thing. P130 shows features of (features are also found on): E70 Thing

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F1 Work with another instance of F1 Work where all expressions of the former will include some expression of the latter. This property is transitive. This property represents the generalized relationship between works that is described at the expression level using *R75 incorporates (is incorporated in)*.

Examples: The musical work by Ludwig van Beethoven entitled ‘Symphony No. 9’ (F1) *uses expression of* the poem ‘An die Freude’ by Friedrich Schiller (F1).

Franz Schubert's kunstlied ‘Erlkönig’ (F1) *uses expression of* the poem ‘Erlkönig’ by Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (F1).

The symphonic poem ‘Vltava’ by Bedřich Smetana (F1) *uses expression of* the melody ‘La Mantovana’  attributed to Giuseppe Cenci (F1).

### R75 incorporates (is incorporated in)

**Vote** to update the property linking expressions of distinct works –one expression incorporating some expression of the other suggested below, namely:

* to accept scope note & examples,
* to assign IDNo
* to update ***R5 has component (is component of)*** –instead of referring to P165 incorporates (is incorporated in), it can now refer to R75 incorporates (is incorporated in).

In favor: 6
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R5_has_component)

**HW**: MD to provide the FOL constraint that the instances of F1 Work involved (some F2 Expression of one being included in the other) are distinct.

#### R75 incorporates (is incorporated in)

**R75 incorporates (is incorporated in)**

Domain: F2 Expression

Range: F2 Expression

Subproperty of: E73 Information Object. P165 incorporates (is incorporated in): E90 Symbolic Object

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F2 Expression with an instance of F2 Expression that is an integral part of the first, but where the existence of the latter realises a different instance of F1 Work is independent of from the first. This property is transitive.

Examples: The 1964 recording of Beethoven's 9th Symphony by Leonard Bernstein and the New York Philharmonic (F2) incorporates the German text of the poem ‘An die Freude’ by Friedrich Schiller (F2).

Franz Schubert's score for the kunstlied ‘Erlkönig’ that was created in 1815 (F2) incorporates the German text of the poem ‘Erlkönig’ by Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (F2).

Pyotr Ilyich Tchaikovsky's graduation cantata performed by Leslie Head and the Kensington Symphony Orchestra in 1978 (F2) incorporates a Russian translation of the poem ‘An die Freude’ by Friedrich Schiller (F2).

##### R5 has component (is component of)

**R5 has component (is component of)**

Domain: F2 Expression

Range: F2 Expression

Subproperty of: E89 Propositional Object. P148 has component (is component of): E89 Propositional Object

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of an F2 Expression X with a structural component Y that conveys a part of the overall work realized by X, such as volumes, chapters, paragraphs. This property is transitive.

Any part of an expression that conveys complete propositions, such as a single phrase, can be documented using the more general property P148 has component (is component of).

Any part of an expression that does not completely follow meaningful boundaries, such as lines or pages of text or portions visible on images, can be documented using the property P106 is composed of (forms part of), and not with R5 has component (is component of). Fragments, in particular, can be documented with the more specific property R15 has fragment (is fragment of).

This property does not cover the relationship that exists between expressions that are realisations of different works, where one is re-used in a new, larger expression. Such a relationship is modelled by P165 R75 incorporates (is incorporated in).

Examples: The Italian text of Dante’s textual work entitled ‘Divina Commedia’ (F2) has component the Italian text of Dante’s textual work entitled ‘Inferno’ (F2).

The musical notation of Mozart’s Singspiel entitled ‘Die Zauberflöte’ (F2) has component the musical notation of Mozart’s aria entitled ‘Der Hölle Rache’, also known as ‘The Queen of the Night’s Aria’ (F2).

The visual content of the map entitled ‘Wales – The Midlands – South West England’, scale 1:400,000, issued by Michelin in 2005 (F2) has component the visual content of the inset entitled ‘Liverpool’, scale 1:200,000, set within the compass of the map titled ‘Wales – The Midlands – South West England’, scale 1:400,000, issued by Michelin in 2005 (F2).

### R8 combines (is combined to form)

**Vote** to update as suggested below, namely:

* to keep the range of R8 as F12 Nomen
* to update the scope note
* to update the full path that R8 stands as the shortcut of
* to delete the superproperty
* to rework the ISBN examples (make sure that only one meaningful substring is mentioned in each example & note that the “leftover” elements that are part of the construction rules need not have to be meaningful as nomens for the property to apply)
* rework all examples to make sure that only one instance of F12 Nomen appears in the range of the property

In favor: 6
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R8_combines_(is)

**HW**: PR to edit the ISBN examples following the template.

#### R8 combines (is combined to form)

The definition of the property changed

##### FROM (old)

**R8 combines (is combined to form)**

Domain: F12 Nomen

Range: E90 Symbolic Object

Subproperty of: E90 Symbolic Object. P106 is composed of (forms part of): E90 Symbolic Object

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with one of the non-syntactic instances of E90 Symbolic Object which are combined to form it.

Examples: The English term ‘starfish’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to echinoderms] combines the English term ‘star’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to celestial bodies], and combines the English term ‘fish’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers, in its looser sense, to animals that live exclusively in water].

The controlled access point ‘The Adoration of the Shepherds (Coventry)’ (F12) combines ‘The Adoration of the Shepherds’ (F12) [a title, i.e., an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a work], and combines ‘Coventry’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a place].

The controlled access point ‘Guillaume, de Machaut, ca. 1300-1377’ (F12) combines ‘Guillaume’ (E90) [a given name], and combines ‘Machaut’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a place], and combines ‘ca. 1300-1377’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a time-span].

The controlled access point ‘Univerza v Ljubljani. Oddelek za bibliotekarstvo’ (F12) combines ‘Univerza v Ljubljani’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a corporate body], and combines ‘Oddelek za bibliotekarstvo’ (F12) [an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to another corporate body, affiliated to the former].

ISBN-10 ‘978-002-002-0’ (F12) combines ‘978’ (E90) [an instance of E90 Symbolic Object indicating the Nigerian ISBN Agency], combines ‘002’ (E90) [an instance of E90 Symbolic Object indicating the Nigerian Institute of International Affairs], combines ‘002’ (E90) [an instance of E90 Symbolic Object used for the publication entitled ‘Nigeria’s international economic relations’], and combines ‘0’ (E90) [an instance of E90 Symbolic Object that constitutes the control character for this ISBN].

##### TO (new)

**R8 combines (is combined to form)**

Domain: F12 Nomen

Range: F12 Nomen

Shortcut of: F12 Nomen (1). R33 has content: E62 String (1). P190i has symbolic content (is symbolic content of): E90 Symbolic Object (1): P106 is composed of: E90 Symbolic Object (2). P190 has symbolic content: E62 String (2). R33i has content (is content of): F12 Nomen (2)

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F12 Nomen with one of the non-syntactic instances of F12 Nomen whose associated E62 string is combine to form it.

###### The examples need to be reworked to only include one instance in the range of the proprerty per example

Examples: The English term ‘starfish’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to echinoderms] *combines* the English term ‘star’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to celestial bodies], and *combines* the English term ‘fish’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers, in its looser sense, to animals that live exclusively in water].

‘The Adoration of the Shepherds (Coventry)’ as a  controlled access point for the work  (F12) *combines* ‘The Adoration of the Shepherds’ (F12) [a title, i.e., as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a work], and *combines* ‘Coventry’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a place].

‘Guillaume, de Machaut, ca. 1300-1377’ as a controlled access point for a person (F12) *combines* ‘Guillaume’ (E90) [as a given name], and *combines* ‘Machaut’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a place], and *combines* ‘ca. 1300-1377’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a time-span].

‘Univerza v Ljubljani. Oddelek za bibliotekarstvo’ as a controlled access point for a corporate body (F12) *combines* ‘Univerza v Ljubljani’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a corporate body], and *combines* ‘Oddelek za bibliotekarstvo’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to another corporate body, affiliated to the former].

ISBN-10 ‘978-002-002-0’ as an identifier for the publication entitled ‘Nigeria’s international economic relations’ (F12) *combines* ‘978’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen indicating the Nigerian ISBN Agency], *combines* ‘002’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen indicating the Nigerian Institute of International Affairs], *combines* ‘002’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen used for the publication entitled ‘Nigeria’s international economic relations’]

‘History -- France -- 14th century’ as a controlled subject term for the concept (F12) *combines* ‘History’ (F12) [as a term for the concept], *combines* ‘France’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to the country], and *combines* ‘14th century’ (F12) [as an instance of F12 Nomen that refers to a time-span]. [These elements combined according to the order and syntax prescribed in the Library of Congress Subject Headings (LCSH) subject headings language.]

‘595.7096’ as a classification number for insects in Africa in the 23rd edition of the Dewey Decimal Classification (F12) *combines* ‘595.7’ as the classification number for insects (the taxonomic class Insecta), and *combines* ‘096’ as the notation corresponding to the continent Africa. [Classification number built according to the structural rules of the Dewey Decimal Classification.]

### R69 specifies physical form (is specified physical form of)

**Vote** to update as suggested; relabel, assign it a superproperty, decide on the quantification, update the scope note, update the examples, and add a new example (e-book and appropriate reader)

In favor: 8
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R69_specifies_physical)

**HW**: PR new example (e-book and appropriate reader).

#### R69 specifies physical form (is specified physical form of)

The definition changed

##### FROM (old)

**R69 specifies physical form (is specified physical form of)**

Domain: F3 Manifestation

Range: E55 Type

Subproperty of: F3 Manifestation. R??: E55 Type

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F3 Manifestation with an instance of E55 Type describing the kind of physical form that characterizes examples carrying this F3 Manifestation. In the case that the F3 Manifestation is intended to be used and distributed in digital form, the property describes the form of the physical carrier on which it can be obtained, e.g.: CD, USB, online file, etc.

In the case that the F3 Manifestation is an abstraction of a singleton item, the property describes the actual physical form the F3 Manifestation was abstracted from. This inference is an induction along the path that can be modelled as: F3 Manifestation. *R7i is materialized in:* F5 Item. *P2 has type*: E55 Type.

It can happen that a given exemplar, or subset of exemplars, originally produced, or intended to be produced, with the specific characteristic, accidentally lacks it. This fact should be recorded as a property of F5 Item, and not of F3 Manifestation.

Examples: The sound recording entitled ‘The Glory (????) of the human voice’, identified by label and label number ‘RCA Victor Gold Seal GD61175’, containing recordings of musical works performed by Florence Foster Jenkins (F3) *specifies physical form* Compact Disc (E55).

##### TO (new)

**R69 has physical form (is specified physical form of)**

Domain: F3 Manifestation

Range: E55 Type

Subproperty of: E1 CRM Entity. P2 has type: E55 Type

Quantification: (1,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F3 Manifestation with an instance of E55 Type describing the kind of physical form that characterizes instances of F5 Item carrying this F3 Manifestation.

 In the case of instances of manifestations intended to be rendered by mediation (such as with electronic devices), the form also indicated the kind of equipment and software tools necessary..

Examples: The publication entitled ‘A clockwork orange’ by Anthony Burgess, published by Penguin Books Ltd in 2008, identified by ISBN ‘0141037229’ (F3) has physical form Printed book (E55).

 The sound recording entitled ‘The Glory (????) of the human voice’, identified by label and label number ‘RCA Victor Gold Seal GD61175’, containing recordings of musical works performed by Florence Foster Jenkins (F3) has physical form Compact Disc (E55).

 The photograph of Billie Holiday by Carl Van Vechten dated 23 March 1949, owned by the Library of Congress and identified by call number LOT 12735, no. 524 [P&P] (F3) has physical form Gelatin silver print (E55).

 The Long Play record entitled ‘Help!’ by The Beatles, released by Parlophone, 6 August 1965, with catalogue number PMC1255 (F3) has physical form Vinyl Long Play record (E55)

### R70 specifies dimension (is specified dimension of)

**Vote** to update as suggested, namely:

* relabel (to R70 has dimension(is dimension of)),
* add a superproperty statement (P43 has dimension),
* edit quantification (one-to-many, dependent (0,n:1,1)),
* update scope note,
* add examples
* **deprecate** *R72 specifies number of parts (is the specified number of parts for)* in favor of *R70 has dimension (is dimension of)*

In favor: 7
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R70_specifies_dimension)

#### R70 specifies dimension (is specified dimension of)

The definition changed

##### FROM (old)

**R70 specifies dimension (is specified dimension of)**

Domain: F3 Manifestation

Range: E54 Dimension

Subproperty of: F3 Manifestation. R??: E54 Dimension

Quantification: (1,n:1,1)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F3 Manifestation with an instance of E54 Dimension that describes aspects of its symbolic content, such as word counts, or describes the kind of physical form that characterizes examples carrying this F3 Manifestation, such as number of pages. In the case that the F3 Manifestation is an abstraction of a singleton item, the property describes the dimensions of the actual physical form the F3 Manifestation was abstracted from.

This inference is an induction along the path that can be modelled as: F3 Manifestation. *R7i is materialized in:* F5 Item. *P43 has dimension:* E54 Dimension.

It can happen that a given exemplar, or subset of exemplars, originally produced, or intended to be produced, with the specific characteristic, accidentally lacks it. This fact should be recorded as a property of F5 Item, and not of F3 Manifestation.

Examples: The publication entitled ‘Functional Requirements for Bibliographic Records: final report’, published by K. G. Saur in 1998, identified by ISBN ‘3-598-11382-X’ (F3) *R70 specifies dimension* height (E54): *P90 has value* ‘24’ (E60) and *P91 has unit* ‘cm’ (E58)

The jigsaw puzzle entitled ‘Map of the New York city subway system’, designed by Stephen J. Voorhies and released around 1954 by the Union Dimes Savings Bank (F3) *R70 specifies dimension* length and height  (E54) *P3 has note* ‘46 x 29 cm’ (E62)

##### TO (new)

**R70 has dimension (is dimension of)**

Domain: F3 Manifestation

Range: E54 Dimension

Subproperty of: E70 Thing. P43 has dimension: E54 Dimension

Quantification: (1,n:1,1)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F3 Manifestation with an instance of E54 Dimension that describes aspects of its symbolic content, such as word counts, or describes the kind of physical form that characterizes instances of F5 Item carrying this F3 Manifestation, such as number of pages.

This inference is an induction along the path that can be modelled as: F3 Manifestation. R7i is materialized in: F5 Item. P43 has dimension: E54 Dimension.

It can happen that a given item, or subset of items, originally produced, or intended to be produced with a certain value for a particular kind of dimension, has a different value for this kind of dimension by accident. This fact should be recorded as a property of F5 Item, and not of F3 Manifestation.

Examples: The publication (printed book) entitled ‘Functional Requirements for Bibliographic Records: final report’, published by K. G. Saur in 1998, identified by ISBN ‘3-598-11382-X’ (F3) *has dimension* height (E54)which *has value (P90)* 24 (E60) and *has unit (P91)* cm (E58).

The publication (printed book) entitled ‘A clockwork orange’ by Anthony Burgess, published by Penguin Books Ltd in 2008, identified by ISBN ‘0141037229’ (F3) *has dimension* number of pages (E54)which *has value (P90)* 176(E60).

The publication (blu-ray box set) entitled ‘Marvel Agents of S.H.I.E.L.D. the Complete Fourth Season’ produced by abc Studios, released in 2018 and identified by EAN *‘*8717418521622’ (F3) *has dimension* number of discs (E54) which *has value (P90)* 6(E60).

The jigsaw puzzle entitled ‘Map of the New York city subway system’, designed by Stephen J. Voorhies and released around 1954 by the Union Dimes Savings Bank (F3) *has dimension* length and height (E54)which *has note (P3)* ‘46 x 29 cm’ (E62).

The jigsaw puzzle entitled ‘Map of the New York city subway system’, designed by Stephen J. Voorhies and released around 1954 by the Union Dimes Savings Bank (F3) *has dimension* number of pieces (E54) which *has value (P90)* 76(E60).

##### R72 specifies number of parts (is the specified number of parts for)

R72 specifies number of parts (is the specified number of parts for) is deprecated

### R71 specifies material part (is specified material part for)

**Vote** to update as suggested, namely:

* relabel (to **R71 has part (is part of)**),
* add a superproperty statement (**P148 has component**),
* update scope note,

In favor: 8
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_R71_specifies_material)

**HW**: Check the scope note of F3 and ensure it covers the concept of what a structural part that is itself an F3 can be, and to clarify that component expressions of manifestations do not necessarily form included manifestations themselves (i.e. if not separable, NOT A UNIT, not an intended publication).

#### R71 specifies material part (is specified material part for)

The definition changed

##### FROM (old):

**R71 specifies material part (is specified material part for)**

Domain: F3 Manifestation

Range: F3 Manifestation

Subproperty of: F3 Manifestation. R??: F3 Manifestation

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property links an instance of F3 Manifestation which prescribes that all its physical exemplars will contain, as a separable part, an exemplar of the associated instance of F3 Manifestation. This property is transitive

##### TO (new):

**R71 has part (is part for)**

Domain: F3 Manifestation

Range: F3 Manifestation

Subproperty of: E89 Propositional Object. P148 has component (is component of): E89 Propositional Object

Quantification: (0,n:0,n)

Scope note: This property associates an instance of F3 Manifestation with a structural part of it that is itself an instance of F3 Manifestation. This property is transitive.

Examples: The publication (printed book) containing J.R.R. Tolkien’s ‘The Lord of the rings’ identified by ISBN ‘0618260587’ (F3) *has part* the publication containing J.R.R. Tolkien’s ‘The two towers’ identified by ISBN ‘0618260595’ (F3).

The compact disc publication issued by Deutsche Grammophon in 1998 and consisting of a recording of Richard Wagner’s ‘Der fliegende Holländer’ as performed in 1991 by Plácido Domingo, Cheryl Studer et al., and conducted by Giuseppe Sinopoli (F3) *has part* a publication consisting of the printed programme notes and libretto (F3).

The compact disc publication issued as a 2-CD set identified as ‘M2K 42270’ by CBS Records in 1987 and consisting of recordings of J. S. Bach’s concertos for keyboard/clavier and strings performed by Glenn Gould (F3) *has part* the compact disc publication identified as ‘DIDC 10370’ consisting of the Glenn Gould recordings of Bach’s Concertos nos. 1-4 (F3).

### Rnn has elaboration/ has specialization

**Vote** to not create Rnn has specialization:

In favor: 7
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: not to create Rnn has specialization after all. Defer reaching a decision re.

1. Deprecation of R10 is member of (has member)
2. Making R67 has part (is part of) a direct subproperty of P148 has component (is component of)
3. Deleting the paragraph in the scope note of R67 that refers to R10

to a later SIG meeting.

### F2 Expression/ F28 Expression Creation

**Vote** to update both F2 and F28:

* delete the paragraph about oral tradition from F28 Expression Creation
* redraft and move the paragraph about oral tradition from the scope note of F28 Expression Creation to F2 Expression
* addition of “À Pierre” example from (deprecated) F25 Performance Plan to F2 Expression
* augment the “Inferno” example of F2 Expression

In favor: 8
Against: none
**Outcome**: accepted

**Decision**: as proposed, for details, see [below](#_F28_Expression_Creation/)

#### Discussion on quantification of R4 embodies (is embodied in)

**Proposal**: change the quantification of R4 from one to many, necessary (1,n:0,n) to (1,n:1,n)

**Discussion**: the quantification as is already declares the property to be one-to-many, necessary.

#### F28 Expression Creation/ F2 Expression

##### F28 Expression Creation

The definition of F28 Expression Creation changed

###### FROM (old)

**F28 Expression Creation**

Subclass of: E12 Production

E65 Creation

F56 Externalization Event

Superclass of: Recording Event

F30 Manifestation Creation

Scope note: This class comprises activities that result in instances of F2 Expression coming into existence. This class characterises the externalisation of an F1 Work. The creation of an instance of F1 Work is considered to occur at the time of creation (F28) of its first F2 Expression.

Although F2 Expression is an abstract entity, a conceptual object, the creation of an expression inevitably also affects the physical world: when you scribble the first draft of a poem on a sheet of paper, you produce an instance of F3 Manifestation. F28 Expression Creation is a subclass of E12 Production because the recording of the expression causes a physical modification of the E18 Physical Thing that serves as the carrier. The work becomes manifest by being expressed on a physical carrier other than the creator’s brain. The spatio-temporal circumstances under which the expression is created are necessarily the same spatio-temporal circumstances under which the first instance of F3 Manifestation is produced.

The mechanisms through which *oral tradition* (of myths, tales, music, etc.) operates are not further investigated in this model. As far as bibliographic practice is concerned, only those instances of F2 Expression that are externalised on physical carriers other than both the creator’s brain and the auditor’s brain are taken into account (for a discussion of the modelling of oral traditions, see: Nicolas, Yann. ‘Folklore Requirements for Bibliographic Records: oral traditions and FRBR.’ In: *Cataloging & Classification Quarterly* (2005). Vol. 39, No. 3-4. P. 179-195).

It is possible to use the *P2 has type (is type of)* property in order to specify that the creation of a given expression of a given work played a particular role with regard to the overall bibliographic history of that work (e.g., that it was the creation of the progenitor expression on which all other expressions of the same work are based; or that it was the creation of the critical edition that served as the basis for canonical references to the work).

An instance of F28 Expression Creation may use as source material a specific existing instance of F2 Expression. The property P16 *used specific object (was used for)* can be used to specify the source expression for the derivation. In cases such as a translation or a revised edition, etc., a new instance of F2 Expression of the same F1 Work, a derived expression, is created. In the situation where an expression of one instance of F1 Work serves as source material for the creation of the first expression of a new instance of F1 Work, the relationship is indicated using the property *R2 is derivative of (has derivative)* between the two instances of F1 Work. Path: F1 Work(1). *R3 is realised in:* F2 Expression(1). *P16i was used for:* F28 Expression Creation. *R17 created*: F2 Expression(2). *R3i realises*: F1 Work(2). *R2 is derivative of*: F1 Work(1)

Examples: the creation of the original manuscript score of ‘Uwertura tragiczna’ by Andrzej Panufnik in 1942 in Warsaw

the reconstruction from memory of the manuscript score of ‘Uwertura tragiczna’ by Andrzej Panufnik in 1945 after the original score was destroyed during the war

the creation, by Lord Byron, of the English text of his work entitled ‘Manfred’ (*P2 has type:* E55 Type {major original contribution})

the creation, by Woldemar Starke, of his German translation of Lord Byron’s text entitled ‘Manfred’ (*P2 has type:* E55 Type {translation})

the recording of the third alternate take of ‘Blue Hawaii’ performed by Elvis Presley in Hollywood, Calif., Radio Recorders, on March 22nd, 1961 (F29) [each individual take is a distinct instance of F2 Expression]

Properties**:** R17 created (was created by): F2 Expression

R18 created (was created by): F5 Item

R19 created a realisation of (was realised through): F1 Work

###### TO (New)

**F28 Expression Creation**

Subclass of: E12 Production

E65 Creation

F56 Externalization Event

Superclass of: Recording Event

F30 Manifestation Creation

Scope note: This class comprises activities that result in instances of F2 Expression coming into existence. This class characterises the externalisation of an F1 Work. The creation of an instance of F1 Work is considered to occur at the time of creation (F28) of its first F2 Expression.

Although F2 Expression is an abstract entity, a conceptual object, the creation of an expression inevitably also affects the physical world: when you scribble the first draft of a poem on a sheet of paper, you produce an instance of F3 Manifestation. F28 Expression Creation is a subclass of E12 Production because the recording of the expression causes a physical modification of the E18 Physical Thing that serves as the carrier. The work becomes manifest by being expressed on a physical carrier other than the creator’s brain. The spatio-temporal circumstances under which the expression is created are necessarily the same spatio-temporal circumstances under which the first instance of F3 Manifestation is produced.

It is possible to use the *P2 has type (is type of)* property in order to specify that the creation of a given expression of a given work played a particular role with regard to the overall bibliographic history of that work (e.g., that it was the creation of the progenitor expression on which all other expressions of the same work are based; or that it was the creation of the critical edition that served as the basis for canonical references to the work).

An instance of F28 Expression Creation may use as source material a specific existing instance of F2 Expression. The property P16 *used specific object (was used for)* can be used to specify the source expression for the derivation. In cases such as a translation or a revised edition, etc., a new instance of F2 Expression of the same F1 Work, a derived expression, is created. In the situation where an expression of one instance of F1 Work serves as source material for the creation of the first expression of a new instance of F1 Work, the relationship is indicated using the property *R2 is derivative of (has derivative)* between the two instances of F1 Work. Path: F1 Work(1). *R3 is realised in:* F2 Expression(1). *P16i was used for:* F28 Expression Creation. *R17 created*: F2 Expression(2). *R3i realises*: F1 Work(2). *R2 is derivative of*: F1 Work(1)

Examples: the creation of the original manuscript score of ‘Uwertura tragiczna’ by Andrzej Panufnik in 1942 in Warsaw

the reconstruction from memory of the manuscript score of ‘Uwertura tragiczna’ by Andrzej Panufnik in 1945 after the original score was destroyed during the war

the creation, by Lord Byron, of the English text of his work entitled ‘Manfred’ (*P2 has type:* E55 Type {major original contribution})

the creation, by Woldemar Starke, of his German translation of Lord Byron’s text entitled ‘Manfred’ (*P2 has type:* E55 Type {translation})

the recording of the third alternate take of ‘Blue Hawaii’ performed by Elvis Presley in Hollywood, Calif., Radio Recorders, on March 22nd, 1961 (F29) [each individual take is a distinct instance of F2 Expression]

Properties**:** R17 created (was created by): F2 Expression

R18 created (was created by): F5 Item

R19 created a realisation of (was realised through): F1 Work

##### F2 Expression

The definition of F2 Expression changed

###### FROM (old)

**F2 Expression**

Subclass of: E73 Information Object

Superclass of: F3 Manifestation

F34 Controlled Vocabulary

Scope note: This classcomprises the intellectual or artistic realisations of Works in the form of identifiable immaterial objects, such as texts, poems, jokes, musical or choreographic notations, movement pattern, sound pattern, images, multimedia objects, or any combination of such forms that have objectively recognisable structures. The substance of F2 Expression is signs.

 An Expression is the outcome of the intellectual or creative process of realizing a Work. Subsequent expressions conveying the same work may be created over time.

Expressions do not depend on a specific physical carrier and can exist on one or more carriers simultaneously, including human memory, but expressions cannot persist without a carrier.

The form of F2 Expression is an inherent characteristic of the F2 Expression. Differences in form implies different Expressions (e.g., from text to spoken word, a transcript of a recording). Similarly, differences in language or means of performance imply different Expressions (e.g., translations or arrangements for different instruments). Thus, if a text is revised or modified, the result is considered to be a new F2 Expression. While theoretically any change in signs will result in a new Expression, conventionally the context and use will determine the rules for distinguishing among expressions.

Examples:

the Italian text of Dante’s ‘Divina Commedia’ as found in the authoritative critical edition ‘La Commedia secondo l’antica vulgata a cura di Giorgio Petrocchi’, Milano: Mondadori, 1966-67 (= ‘Le Opere di Dante Alighieri’, Edizione Nazionale a cura della Società Dantesca Italiana, VII, 1-4) (F2, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the Italian text of Dante’s ‘Inferno’ as found in the same edition (F2, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the signs which make up Christian Morgenstern’s ‘Fisches Nachtgesang’ [a poem consisting simply of ‘—’ and ‘˘’ signs, arranged in a specific combination]

 the set of instructions for the production of a Yiddish translation of the textual work entitled ‘King Lear’*,* as directed by Sergei Radlov in Moscow in 1935 (F2, E29, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the set of instructions for the production of the ballet entitled ‘Rite of spring’, as choreographed by Pina Bausch in Wuppertal in 1975 (F2, E29, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the set of instructions by Bruno Walter for performing Gustav Mahler’s 9th symphony, delivered by him to the Columbia Symphony Orchestra during rehearsals in Hollywood in 1961 (as partially documented in the CD entitled ‘Bruno Walter conducts and talks about Mahler symphony No. 9: rehearsal & performance’) (F2, E29) [multiple instantiation]

the set of instructions contained in the “performance handbook” for Luigi Nono’s musical work entitled ‘À Pierre’ (F2, E29, E33) [multiple instantiation]

Properties**:** R5 has component (is component of): F2 Expression

R15 has fragment (is fragment of): E90 Symbolic Object

R75 incorporates (is incorporated in): F2 Expression

###### TO (new)

**F2 Expression**

Subclass of: E73 Information Object

Superclass of: F3 Manifestation

F34 Controlled Vocabulary

Scope note: This classcomprises the intellectual or artistic realisations of Works in the form of identifiable immaterial objects, such as texts, poems, jokes, musical or choreographic notations, movement pattern, sound pattern, images, multimedia objects, or any combination of such forms that have objectively recognisable structures. The substance of F2 Expression is signs.

 An Expression is the outcome of the intellectual or creative process of realizing a Work. Subsequent expressions conveying the same work may be created over time.

Expressions do not depend on a specific physical carrier and can exist on one or more carriers simultaneously. As far as bibliographic practice is concerned, only instances of F2 Expression that are externalised on physical carriers other than both the creator’s brain and the auditor’s brain are taken into account.

The form of F2 Expression is an inherent characteristic of the F2 Expression. Differences in form implies different Expressions (e.g., from text to spoken word, a transcript of a recording). Similarly, differences in language or means of performance imply different Expressions (e.g., translations or arrangements for different instruments). Thus, if a text is revised or modified, the result is considered to be a new F2 Expression. While theoretically any change in signs will result in a new Expression, conventionally the context and use will determine the rules for distinguishing among expressions.

Examples:

the Italian text of Dante’s ‘Divina Commedia’ as found in the authoritative critical edition ‘La Commedia secondo l’antica vulgata a cura di Giorgio Petrocchi’, Milano: Mondadori, 1966-67 (= ‘Le Opere di Dante Alighieri’, Edizione Nazionale a cura della Società Dantesca Italiana, VII, 1-4) (F2, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the Italian text of Dante’s ‘Inferno’ as found in the same edition authoritative critical edition ‘La Commedia secondo l’antica vulgata a cura di Giorgio Petrocchi’, Milano: Mondadori, 1966-67 (= ‘Le Opere di Dante Alighieri’, Edizione Nazionale a cura della Società Dantesca Italiana, VII, 1-4) (F2, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the original English text of Lord Byron’s work entitled ‘Manfred’ (F2, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the German text translated by Woldemar Starke, of Lord Byron’s text entitled ‘Manfred’ (F2, E33) [multiple instantiation]

the signs which make up Christian Morgenstern’s ‘Fisches Nachtgesang’ [a poem consisting simply of ‘—’ and ‘˘’ signs, arranged in a specific combination]

the set of instructions contained in the “performance handbook” for Luigi Nono’s musical work entitled ‘À Pierre’ (F2, E29, E33) [multiple instantiation]

Properties**:** R5 has component (is component of): F2 Expression

R15 has fragment (is fragment of): E90 Symbolic Object

R75 incorporates (is incorporated in): F2 Expression

### F56 Externalization Event

The LRMoo group will reconsider (a) deprecating F29 Recording Event and (b) drafting a property whereby to link F31 Performance and F28 Expression Creation that will be IsA P9 consists of.

Provide a concrete proposal to be discussed extensively in the next SIG meeting. The proposal should cover the superproperties of **R65 recorded aspects of (had aspects recorded through)** and **R20 recorded (was recorded through)** too.

**HW**: PR, TA, MZ, MD