### 498: Places of disjoint areas

MD presented HW (new scope note for E53 Place) to convey the meaning that instances of E53 Place need not be one contiguous area (can be aggregations of disjoint areas).

**Discussion points**:

**DH** came up with some examples:

* Old settlement of Helsinki (or Helsingfors) located in the area of the modern airport, not on the coast. The same story with Upsala in Sweden.
  + NOTE: These constitute E7 Activities, which have a spatial projection of two disjoint areas, jumping to say so to another place.
* The capitals transferred in modern time: Moscow-St Petersburg-Moscow.
  + NOTE: Here we have a move of an administrational unit, which we use to model as a special case of E4 Period.
* “Normal” examples are countries with islands etc.

**OE**: the island examples and Kaliningrad are good examples, the move of the capital and the Helsinki example are not valid. They form different places, each connected to a specific period. He claims that each of the two examples lists two disjoint places.

**MD**: not really, these places are regarded as instances of E92 STV and the fact that their spatial projection differs from time to time does not raise an issue.

**Decision**:

* accept the proposed edits to the scope-note. Details below.
* Rework the examples by DH for E53 and
* Start a new issue where to discuss updating the definition of E4 (clarification in the scope note AND examples section).

**The scope note changed**

#### FROM (v7.1.1)

**E53 Place**

Subclass of:

[E1](https://docs.google.com/document/d/14c-eXteuhs49z1IPyTA-NBup7e2XCQf2/edit#heading=h.1fob9te) CRM Entity

Scope note:

This class comprises extents in space, in particular on the surface of the earth, in the pure sense of physics: independent from temporal phenomena and matter.

The instances of E53 Place are usually determined by reference to the position of “immobile” objects such as buildings, cities, mountains, rivers, or dedicated geodetic marks, but may also be determined by reference to mobile objects. A Place can be determined by combining a frame of reference and a location with respect to this frame.

 It is sometimes argued that instances of E53 Place are best identified by global coordinates or absolute reference systems. However, relative references are often more relevant in the context of cultural documentation and tend to be more precise. In particular, we are often interested in position in relation to large, mobile objects, such as ships. For example, the Place at which Nelson died is known with reference to a large mobile object – H.M.S Victory. A resolution of this Place in terms of absolute coordinates would require knowledge of the movements of the vessel and the precise time of death, either of which may be revised, and the result would lack historical and cultural relevance.

Any instance of E18 Physical Thing can serve as a frame of reference for an instance of E53 Place. This may be documented using the property *P157 is at rest relative to (provides reference space for*

#### TO (v7.2)

**E53 Place**

Subclass of:

[E1](https://docs.google.com/document/d/14c-eXteuhs49z1IPyTA-NBup7e2XCQf2/edit#heading=h.1fob9te) CRM Entity

Scope note:

This class comprises extents in the natural space we live in, in particular on the surface of the Eearth, in the pure sense of physics: independent from temporal phenomena and matter. They may serve describing the physical location of things or phenomena or other areas of interest. Geometrically, instances of E53 Place constitute single contiguous areas or a finite aggregation of disjoint areas in space which are each individually contiguous. They may have fuzzy boundaries.

The instances of E53 Place are usually determined by reference to the position of “immobile” objects such as buildings, cities, mountains, rivers, or dedicated geodetic marks, but may also be determined by reference to mobile objects. A Place can be determined by combining a frame of reference and a location with respect to this frame.

 It is sometimes argued that instances of E53 Place are best identified by global coordinates or absolute reference systems. However, relative references are often more relevant in the context of cultural documentation and tend to be more precise. In particular, we are often interested in positions in relation to large, mobile objects, such as ships. For example, the Place at which Nelson died is known with reference to a large mobile object – H.M.S Victory. A resolution of this Place in terms of absolute coordinates would require knowledge of the movements of the vessel and the precise time of death, either of which may be revised, and the result would lack historical and cultural relevance.

Any instance of E18 Physical Thing can serve as a frame of reference for an instance of E53 Place. This may be documented using the property *P157 is at rest relative to (provides reference space for)*.